

# The Foundation of a Claim

- Introduce the quote or example / don't just plop it in
- Provide QUALITY evidence
- Provide COMMENTARY explaining its significance

# We need COMMENTARY to ANALYZE and EXPLAIN the significance of the evidence

- **Claim:** Odysseus was smart.
- **Evidence:** He got the cyclops drunk and said his name was Nobody.
- **Commentary:** Giving the cyclops drunk makes him more vulnerable and less clear headed. Furthermore, because the cyclops tells the other cyclops Nobody hurt him, they do not realize he is in need of their help allowing Odysseus and his men to escape. Clearly, these decisions demonstrate his intelligence and help him and much of his crew survive.

The SAME piece of evidence can be used for DIFFERENT claims depending on the explanation used.



**EVIDENCE from a pet:**

**My owners take care of me, feed me,  
and love me.**

**How can this evidence be used to  
prove DIFFERENT things?**

# Cat's Commentary based on that evidence:

Therefore, I must be king!



# Dog's Commentary Based on that Evidence:

Therefore, my OWNERS must be kings!



# Ex: Atticus threatens to whip Scout but then doesn't follow through.

shows he's a BAD parent because parents follow through w/ what they say

shows he's a GOOD parent because she straightens up and he realizes it's not necessary and most importantly he avoids violence

# Part 2: Revisiting Commentary

Small Group Activity



# Who is to blame for Romeo and Juliet's deaths?

Romeo and/or Juliet?

The Friar?

Their parents?

The Nurse?

How can the SAME piece of evidence from the play be used to hold DIFFERENT people responsible for their deaths?

How can the **SAME** piece of evidence be used against the Friar OR Romeo and Juliet?

The Friar didn't get the letter to Romeo.

FRIAR: he should have taken the letter himself knowing how important it was or at least told Friar John what the letter said so he would have known how important it was so he would not have turned back.

**ROMEO:** Romeo should have never taken drastic, fatal action without first hearing from the Friar especially since the Friar told him to wait for word from him. It was his impulsiveness that lead to him taking his own life before getting all of the information.

Now it is YOUR turn. How can you use this same evidence against the Friar as well as against Romeo and /or Juliet?

Think / Pair / Share



Romeo and Juliet hardly knew each other because they just met.

Taking a sleeping potion that makes someone appear dead is dangerous.

There was a long standing feud between the two families that just erupted in the streets.